



The following is the transcript of the workshop meeting of July 16th 2009.

Scathach Rhiadra: Hello Stim!
Stim Morane: Scathach, Hi!
Stim Morane: And Pila!
Pila Mulligan: hi Scathach and Stim
Scathach Rhiadra: Hello Pila
Eliza Madrigal: Hi Stim, Scath, Pila :))
Gaya Ethaniel: Hello Eliza and all :)
Scathach Rhiadra: Hello Eliza
Eliza Madrigal: And Gaya once again... that was fast. hah
Gaya Ethaniel: ^.-
Scathach Rhiadra: Gaya:)
Stim Morane: Hi Gaya, Eliza, Mick
Gaya Ethaniel: Hello Mick :)
Eliza Madrigal: Hi Mick
Scathach Rhiadra: Hello Mick
Pila Mulligan: hi Gaya, Eliza and Mick
Mickorod Renard: Hiya Stim Gaya Scath Eliza
Mickorod Renard: Hi Pila
Gaya Ethaniel: Feels like ages since last workshop somehow :)
Mickorod Renard: Hi Fef
Gaya Ethaniel: Hello Fefonoz :)
Eliza Madrigal: Hi Fef
Pila Mulligan: hi Fefonoz
Stim Morane: Hi Fefonoz
Scathach Rhiadra: even longer to the next one!
Fefonoz Quan: hey all! :)
Scathach Rhiadra: Hello Fefonoz
Gaya Ethaniel nods. True ...
Mickorod Renard: isnt pila going to fill in between
Pila Mulligan: :)
Stim Morane: Gaya, have you been heavily involved in lots of projects or activities since last week?
Mickorod Renard: ;)
Gaya Ethaniel: No a lot happened 'internally' I think.
Stim Morane: I see
Gaya Ethaniel: Yes we have Pila :)
Stim Morane: OK, good.
Gaya Ethaniel: :)
Stim Morane: Gaya submitted a "report" following up on our last meeting. Has everyone read it?
Mickorod Renard: sorry i havnt
Stim Morane: (Sorry, I'm jumping right in today, just to save time.)
Mickorod Renard: have u a link at all ps?
Stim Morane: http://ways-of-knowing.wik.is/3Reports/Gaya_Ethaniel/Report_21
Mickorod Renard: ta

Eliza Madrigal: yes, have read both reports
 Shyama Sheryffe: hi
 Pila Mulligan: hi Shyama
 Eliza Madrigal: Hi Shy :)
 Scathach Rhiadra: Hello shyama
 Stim Morane: hi shyama
 Gaya Ethaniel: Hello Shyama :)
 Stim Morane: we're looking at a brief report by Gaya:
 Stim Morane: http://ways-of-knowing.wik.is/3Reports/Gaya_Ethaniel/Report_21
 Mickorod Renard: Hi Shy
 Mickorod Renard: nice reportGaya
 Gaya Ethaniel: Thanks :)
 Fefonz Quan: yes, dramatic dream!
 Mickorod Renard: I hope to be more active now that School is fininished for summer
 Pila Mulligan: "I see how 'I go' with fear"
 Stim Morane: Yes, thanks Gaya!
 Mickorod Renard: forgive me for being a lil distracted recently
 Gaya Ethaniel: Sorry I couldn't make last week informal meeting. We meet again however can this Sunday I hope :)
 Gaya Ethaniel: whoever*
 Stim Morane: The funeral of the self is a classic image.
 Gaya Ethaniel: Is it? heh :)
 Stim Morane: So Gaya, do you have any further comments regarding acceptance?
 Pila Mulligan: think Ebenezer Scrooge, Gaya :)
 Gaya Ethaniel: Well how I go usually seem to involve ideas about myself regarding fear. As in, "should enjoy challenges" "I don't like being such a whimp etc." But I seem to turn away almost automatically out of 'habit'.
 Mickorod Renard: if i may,,is the acceptance we are discussing only relevent to dreams,,or life in general?
 Stim Morane: Mick, I guess it's pretty broad
 Mickorod Renard: ty
 Stim Morane: Certainly not just regarding dreams
 Gaya Ethaniel: I can see now that I turn away, I just try to face it again. That's the best I can do for now.
 Gaya Ethaniel: ahhh Scrooge :)
 Stim Morane: Yes, Gaya ... just seeing more of what tends to happen is fine for now.
 Stim Morane: This is tricky because what we usually call "seeing what happens" actually involves a lot of interpretation
 Gaya Ethaniel: Mick, I talked about the dream at a PaB session and I came to see the relevance to the workshop in regards to 'going' afterwards when I read the log again later.
 Gaya Ethaniel: ok Stim :)
 Stim Morane: brb
 Mickorod Renard: I have observed that a large part of my change in life has been due to being more accepting
 Mickorod Renard: ok thanks Stim

Fefonze Quan nods to Mick, mine too

Stim Morane: sorry, back

Stim Morane: Yes, Mick. The issue of acceptance applies to much of what you were describing to us a few weeks ago too.

Stim Morane: Acceptance and "seeing" are inseparable

Gaya Ethaniel: To be honest, I don't know how it works re: fear in my mind. I'm just happy to see that how the whole process starts.

Stim Morane: Yes, this is a big topic in its own right.

Stim Morane: Anyway, you're working on an important issue and I look forward to hearing more about how it's going over time.

Gaya Ethaniel: ok will do :)

Stim Morane: Pila also wrote a report for us. It's at:

Stim Morane: http://ways-of-knowing.wikis/3Reports/Pila_Mulligan/Workshop_21

Fefonze Quan: interesting report Pila.

Eliza Madrigal nods... very

Stim Morane: Yes

Gaya Ethaniel nods :)

Pila Mulligan: thnaks

Stim Morane: There's quite a lot in your report, Pila. I suggest we step through it slowly.

Fefonze Quan: I liked the breathing part, though I find it works both ways

Stim Morane: But first, did you want to add any further perspectives to what you wrote?

Pila Mulligan: oh yes

Pila Mulligan: my mind never really frees me

Stim Morane: :)

Pila Mulligan: There is the idea of interconnected awareness, and to me emptiness describes a perception that is uplifting of awareness, with ethics being the art of sensitivity to the uplifting of interconnected awareness. We may reach the emptiness perception by some form of practice, then the experience of the perception can serve as an ethical guide. Yet humans seem to ordinarily have a spontaneous reverence for natural beauty, and that reverence relates to the same idea of ethics. So we can approach the uplifting experience and the related idea of ethics from various angles.

Pila Mulligan: [finis]

Stim Morane: Great

Stim Morane: I mentioned that we could spend part of our session today on how codependent arising relates to your practice-related experience and also to Fefonze's interests.

Mickorod Renard: phew,,heavy stuff Pila

Stim Morane: Pila, shall we start with points drawn from your report?

Pila Mulligan: yes

Pila Mulligan: I will need to let you start Stim

Stim Morane: I appreciated that you put the "Confucius" quote in the context of actually being part of a story by Chuang-tzu.

Stim Morane: Chuang-tzu was a rascal and loved to make stories with famous characters in them

Stim Morane: The view you mention wouldn't actually have made much sense to Confucius, I think, but it works fine as a story in Chuang-tzu

Pila Mulligan: :)

Gaya Ethaniel: ahhh Jang-ja :)

Stim Morane: So just to make a quick point regarding that ...

Pila Mulligan: I also understand Chang Tze to feel there are too many valid possible varieties of personal experience for one to prescribe some of them and proscribe the others as descriptions of reality.

Stim Morane: He was doing some innovative, boundary-crossing things, unusual for his time perhaps.

Pila Mulligan: maybe akin to Nagarjuna?

Stim Morane: He was a student of logic and the limitations of language and categories of ordinary thought

Stim Morane: Yes, perhaps he was somewhat like Nagarjuna

Stim Morane: His primary interest was in spoofing the idea that our knowledge really covers very much of the range of reality

Stim Morane: He loved to turn our ordinary views upsidedown

Stim Morane: And along the way, he was illustrating some classic Taoist ideas.

Stim Morane: One of them relates to your first sentence regarding " how perception proceeds to emptiness (from the senses through the mind to primal spirit.) "

Stim Morane: This refers to the Daoist idea of "return", return to Tao.

Stim Morane: I take it that you have been working on various practices that implement this return, is that right?

Pila Mulligan: yes, I hope so, it seems so

Stim Morane: :)

Stim Morane: Good

Stim Morane: In true chuang-tzu spirit, we shouldn't be too certain!

Pila Mulligan: reminds me of that nice part of Corinthians, 'whe I was a child ..'

Gaya Ethaniel: Tao means path?

Stim Morane: Tao literally means path or road or Way ... Or even "say"

Gaya Ethaniel: ah ok

Stim Morane: But here it refers to reality, the overarching reality that is everywhere present but usually not appreciated or followed very well by pesky human beings

Stim Morane: Hence the need for "return"

Stim Morane: Anyway, the weird codependent arising point we've been discussing in this forum would critique this "return" notion and its destination, "Tao"

Pila Mulligan: how so stim?

Stim Morane: This doesn't mean I am taking the side of codependent arising over that of Daoism, but just to illustrate the point behind Nagarjuna's teaching ...

Pila Mulligan: ah

Stim Morane: The 2nd version of codependent arising would say something like this:

Pila Mulligan: reification

Stim Morane: sort of, yes

Stim Morane: The "primal spirit" is codependent with other features of what is immediately present in your view at that moment and doesn't have any reality apart from that.

Stim Morane: This would be Nagarjuna's teaching

Stim Morane: I'm claiming that both his point and that of traditional practitioners following Taoism are valid and important

Fefonz Quan: (un-atman?)

Stim Morane: yes, fefonz

Stim Morane: Something like that

Pila Mulligan: the primal spriti abstraction, however, is a nice representation of interconnectedness

Pila Mulligan: nature can serve the same purpose without needing abstraction

Stim Morane: the point for our purposes is not to reject traditional practice orientations, but to use codependent arising to make them even more radically effective

Gaya Ethaniel: un-atman? Atman in Hinduism?

Stim Morane: Yes, Pila

Stim Morane: Right, Gaya

Gaya Ethaniel: ah ok

Stim Morane: This is a big subject, and one we can't really discuss much here, but the basic idea is that we can benefit from cultivating a return to "primal spirit" and we can benefit from seeing that this "primal spirit" as a guiding feature of our practice is codependent arisen and thus empty

Stim Morane: This is not a rejection but an amplification of direct seeing regarding what we've got at a given moment and what is limiting our presence

Stim Morane: I hope my comments will not be seen as a criticism of anyone's practice or of any tradition

Pila Mulligan: :)

Stim Morane: I'm just illustrating the Madhyamaka angle

Fefonz Quan: how can you criticize something that is already empty? :)

Stim Morane: true, I cannot criticize what is already seen to be empty by its own nature.

Stim Morane: Fefonz, my point was simply that I'm not criticizing anything, just illustrating ...

Fefonz Quan nods

Gaya Ethaniel: If I don't mean to criticize, it's not a criticism is it ...?

Mickorod Renard: I am still a bit fuzzy in the head with it

Mickorod Renard: ;)

Shyama Sheryffe: is fascinated but tired as it's late so she waves goodbye to all

Stim Morane: well, it could be a criticism in form and substance, Gaya.

Green Tea whispers: Enjoy your tea

Stim Morane: By SHyama

Mickorod Renard: bye Shy

Gaya Ethaniel: Bye Shamay :)

Fefonz Quan: bye shy

Stim Morane: Anyway, yes, I see what you mean, Gaya

Pila Mulligan: bye Shy

Gaya Ethaniel: I don't get that ... but I will think on it Stim.

Fefonz Quan: thanks green! (fefonz raises his glass :)

Stim Morane: All I'm saying is that I'm using points raised by any of us, starting with Pila today, to illustrate how a certain tradition of codependent arising would unpack

Stim Morane: For instance, the same tradition would say that the perceiving (yin) mind is no different from the ration (yang) mind that Pila mentions ...

Stim Morane: *rational

Pila Mulligan: :)

Stim Morane: This because both are codependent arising and "empty"

Stim Morane: Yes, I know ... :)

Pila Mulligan: would that the mind agreed

Stim Morane: But your mind is itself codependent arisen, not fixed

Stim Morane: This is the idea, anyway

Eliza Madrigal: this speaks to not being able to reform ordinary mind, which, in tune with nature is/ can be a beautiful, even harmonious thing? So ordinary not in the sense of 'mere' but in the sense of direct seeing?

Stim Morane: We can thaw out the ordinary mind ... By seeing more of its open, "empty" nature, it can be more flexible, more creative, etc

Mickorod Renard: would either you Stim or Pila have an example of how this would unviel in everyday practice?

Stim Morane: Sure, take anger

Stim Morane: Anger is hard, frozen, unyieldingly negative

Stim Morane: But it is also codependent arisen, thus empty, thus open

Mickorod Renard: I see

Stim Morane: Flexible ... We could see this and stop on a dime, as Americans say.

Stim Morane: :)

Mickorod Renard: nice idea

Stim Morane: The angry mind could be the compassionate mind more or less instantly

Stim Morane: Emptiness is useful!

Fefonz Quan: that sounds like a very skillful practice

Mickorod Renard: I think I may subconsciously practice it in a way

Stim Morane: Say more, Mick?

Mickorod Renard: sometimes,,but more often now

Mickorod Renard: well,,its perhaps in relation to my past trend to want to act and control events that i feel are not ideal,,now I see it as empty and give it less importance

Pila Mulligan: as an ananlogy, your hand or foot may go to sleep (an english idiom) and you can rub or shake it and it will wake up or return to its ordinary sensitivty

Eliza Madrigal: hmm

Pila Mulligan: or oyu can let it tingle and bother you

Stim Morane: :)

Gaya Ethaniel: :)

Stim Morane: I'm happy with all sorts of perceived connections along those lines ...

Stim Morane: The main point is that things are not frozen, intractible

Mickorod Renard: there are many things that i would get annoyed about,,even though the milk has been spilt as it were,,but now I have the pacivity to say „hey,,dont worry

Stim Morane: We don't even have to transform them via some process, they are self-open

Stim Morane: Yes, Mick, I think that counts.

Mickorod Renard: whats done is done,,or whatever

Stim Morane: And it would also be nice to look more directly at the spilt milk and see that it has never been spilled.

Stim Morane: This is the codependent arising point

Mickorod Renard: it has little relevance now

Stim Morane: The very way that things are present is the way that they are "not"

Mickorod Renard: the spilt milk

Fefonz Quan: can you say more about that one stim?

Stim Morane: Yes, Mick, I see what you mean.

Stim Morane: Well, Fefonz, this is the main point of the Madhyamaka tradition

Stim Morane: And we've been mentioning little bits regarding that

Stim Morane: But I know it's going to take more time than we will ever have together to really unpack it

Stim Morane: Basically I'm just encouraging a renewal of direct "seeing"

Fefonz Quan: but some more sentences might help :)

Stim Morane: Not taking things for granted, taking them as given

Eliza Madrigal: :)

Fefonz Quan: i thought spilled is just spilled is teh given approach

Mickorod Renard: its funny,,I was thinking of asking if anyone wanted to do a pab slot on forgiveness (an issue close to many hearts),but in a way this covers some

Gaya Ethaniel: Given?

Fefonz Quan: [14:48] Stim Morane: Not taking things for granted, taking them as given

Stim Morane: Well, we have 12 minutes left and still haven't even gotten past the first few sentences of Pila's report!

Gaya Ethaniel: :)

Mickorod Renard: grin

Pila Mulligan: let's shift over to Fefonz's part maybe :)

Fefonz Quan: one minute for every cod-ar link :)

Stim Morane: Pila, if we do that, we'll certainly want to come back to your report later.

Pila Mulligan: ok

Stim Morane: There are many important things in it

Pila Mulligan: thnaks

Fefonz Quan: i can wait to next time

Stim Morane: No it's ok, fefonz

Stim Morane: We can move on to your side for now

Stim Morane: What would you like to discuss?

Fefonz Quan: it's better to stay on points we all wonder about

Stim Morane: Nice if possible

Stim Morane: How are we doing so far?

Stim Morane: :)

Fefonz Quan: well infact this is close to my point,

Stim Morane: Yes?

Fefonz Quan: i can see cod-ar as things effecting each other in infact infinite ways, but that happens in time.

Stim Morane: Yes.

Stim Morane: That version of codependent arising is DIFFERENT

Fefonz Quan: the spilled milk is connected to many event in the ast and maybe future

Stim Morane: YES

Fefonz Quan: yet, right now, it is slipped.

Fefonz Quan: spilled.

Stim Morane: my purpose in this forum is simply to trot out a few of the main (quite different) versions of cod

Stim Morane: codependent arising

Fefonz Quan: and the interconnectness, or emptiness of that fact, out of time, is very elusive

Stim Morane: The one you've mentioned is linked to Pila's "interrelatedness"

Stim Morane: There are probably about 7 main types of codependent arising (for this forum)

Fefonz Quan: yes, but i wonder more about nagarjuna's point

Stim Morane: Nagarjuna's angle was quite different from anything that is easy relate to modern views

Stim Morane: He wasn't denying causal interconnectedness of sorts that figure in modern science

Fefonz Quan: exactly. yet, you wouldn't say it is useless and dated ecause of it

Stim Morane: He was just saying that for "spiritual practice" it's important not to take anything for granted

Stim Morane: This is because his understanding of the real fruit of contemplation is beyond all categories, even beyond "something that is beyond ..."

Stim Morane: It is also beyond processes leading to a result

Fefonz Quan: but he didn't meant this is just a tool, and reality has nothing to do with it

Stim Morane: Right, Fefonz

Stim Morane: But "reality" is a loaded term

Stim Morane: the "reality" he was concerned with is different from the one a physicist studies

Stim Morane: Exactly how these two are going to be put in a meaningful relation to one another is a great question

Fefonz Quan: it is loaded, and i understand that, but yet when a car is giong your way or someone is going to die, this is not only physical reality, it is personal in any other effect

Stim Morane: But frankly there is no way that synthesis could ever be accomplished without having the direct awakeness that Nagarjuna was emphasizing

Stim Morane: Yes fefonz, of course

Stim Morane: But the whole range of things involved in your car example don't cover all the bases Nagarjuna was concerned about

Stim Morane: This is why we have our work cut out for us in this forum

Stim Morane: And why I was so eager to not do the forum!

Stim Morane: It's a very tricky subject

Stim Morane: "you" are much more than what is injured in car accidents

Gaya Ethaniel: Well reality Fefonz is saying happens but after that ... it is no more, it's not reality anymore. That's the best I can describe it.

Gaya Ethaniel: [reality' as Fefonz used in both above]

Mickorod Renard: is this something to do with deconstruction?

Stim Morane: Nagarjuna was interested in the rest of what "you" are, over and above the body, mind, life, death, etc stuff

Stim Morane: Mick, some people have seen Nagarjuna as primarily deconstructive, yes

Mickorod Renard: ty

Fefonz Quan: thanks, that's a great notion Stim.

Stim Morane: But I think that leaves out how "deconstruction" itself would work, and what it would achieve, in his context

Fefonz Quan: and that ;you' interest me very much too, tha's why i brought that up

Stim Morane: See, his deconstruction is intended to open to enlightenment

Stim Morane: Not just to critique something

Stim Morane: In the ordinary context, if you deconstruct something, you're back in the ordinary context

Mickorod Renard: mmmmmmm

Stim Morane: For Nagarjuna, if you deconstruct the "posits" that constitute our ordinary reality, where are you? What are you?

Mickorod Renard: mick needs to do some homework

Stim Morane: He's not going to say, of course

Stim Morane: Well, we've just gotten started, Mick. Don't worry ...

Fefonz Quan: so in a way, it's more that the 'you' in intrerconnected with the world you see around, the 'you' vanishes, dissolves, IS the world you aperceive around,

Fefonz Quan: ia* interconnected

Stim Morane: Maybe, fefonz

Fefonz Quan: is*

Stim Morane: I'd have to talk with you more to make sure

Stim Morane: Unfortunately, we're out of time today

Fefonz Quan: not that i can percieve it in less then intelectual sense

Mickorod Renard: very interesting Stim

Pila Mulligan: thanks Stim, have a nice retreat

Mickorod Renard: yes,,have a lovely time Stim

Eliza Madrigal: Thank you Stim

Gaya Ethaniel: Would be interesting to hear how you see co-dependent arising Fefonz :)

Fefonz Quan: Yes, Thank you Stim!

Gaya Ethaniel: Enjoy the retreat Stim :)

Mickorod Renard: do u have a quick fix for jelousy Stim,,cos i am

Fefonz Quan: i am just a novice student of that gaya

Scathach Rhiadra: thank you Stim, enjoy the retreat

Gaya Ethaniel: I'd be interested in listening if you're willing :)

Gaya Ethaniel: Maybe this Sun??

Gaya Ethaniel: :)

Stim Morane: When we pick up again in a couple of weeks, I will list thenergy 7 or so versions of codependent arising I'm interested in summarizing, try to distinguish them briefly, and continue to explain how some of them relate to your life practice

Fefonz Quan: good idea

Stim Morane: *the 7 or so

Pila Mulligan: :)

Eliza Madrigal: :)

Fefonz Quan: :)

Mickorod Renard: I thought there were only 6

Gaya Ethaniel: ok look forward to meeting again Stim :)

Stim Morane: Bye, everyone! Have a good "vacation" from this weird forum!

Fefonz Quan: that's just a number Mick :0

Eliza Madrigal: haha

Mickorod Renard: he he

Pila Mulligan: bye

Gaya Ethaniel: :)

Mickorod Renard: bye pila,,thanks

Gaya Ethaniel: So next 2 weeks Stim's away right?

Eliza Madrigal: Sounds like a new tag "Weird forum attender"

Fefonz Quan: seems llike that

Scathach Rhiadra: yes

Gaya Ethaniel: Can't we have Pila and Fefonz talking each week?

Mickorod Renard: i would like that

Gaya Ethaniel: :)

Eliza Madrigal: I'm in if so

Pila Mulligan: I'm nt really capable of filling Stim's place Gaya

Gaya Ethaniel: Just want to know about your practice Pila :)

Fefonz Quan: i wouldn't think it will be appropriate in Stim's workshop

Gaya Ethaniel: We don't have to post the logs of course :) just informally gathering.

Fefonz Quan: (for me anyway)

Mickorod Renard: I am sure no one can replace Stim Pila,,but you are so very good like stim in your way

Scathach Rhiadra: I must go, good night all, Namaste

Gaya Ethaniel: Open discussions as in PaB you know.

Pila Mulligan: thanks Mick, but Pila seconds Fefonz's comment

Fefonz Quan: Night Scath!

Gaya Ethaniel: Good night Scath :)

Mickorod Renard: nite Scath

Pila Mulligan: bye Scath

Eliza Madrigal: Night Scathach